

The Management Gaps toward Inclusive Education Implementation at Higher Education in Indonesia

Fina Riswari, Fiolina Hana Puspitasari, Neny Yuniarti, Silvana Rahma Iswahyudi, Asep Sunandar, Ediyanto, Ahsan Romadlon Junaidi

Special Education Department, Faculty of Education, Universitas Negeri Malang, Indonesia

Corresponding author:
Asep Sunandar,
asep.sunandar.fip@um.ac.id

Article history:
Received November 20, 2021
Revised June 17, 2022
Accepted June 21, 2022

Published online at
ijds.ub.ac.id

Copyright © 2022 Author(s)
Licensed under CC BY NC.



Abstract

The commitment to implementing inclusive education in Indonesia is already at the higher education level. However, in reality, disabled people still have difficulty obtaining opportunities to study in university. Concerning the gap in inclusive education (commitment and implementation), this article aims to examine the inclusive education management performance at universities in Indonesia. This review is critical because only 401 disabled people in Indonesia are registered as students at various universities in Indonesia. The articles in the current study go through three stages of narrative review: determining the scope of the research focus, determining the urgency and novelty of the research, and determining the research formulation and objectives. A study of 14 articles through the Google Scholar database was published in 2000-2021. The study results show that most universities in Indonesia are still not open to inclusive education and the admission of students with disabilities implementation. In addition, universities in Indonesia are not ready to provide management and facilities that support the learning process and the accessibility of the campus environment to suit the needs of students with disabilities. Human resources in higher education such as lecturers and education staff are not ready to provide services and modify learning for disabled students.

Keywords: Inclusive Education, Student with Disabilities, Higher Education, Education Management

1. Introduction

According to a 2011 survey by the Indonesian Disabled Persons Association of Yogyakarta Province, the number of people with disabilities currently pursuing public and private higher education in Yogyakarta is 98 people (visual disabilities, physically disabilities, and hearing disabilities). Until now, in reality, groups of people with disabilities still have to fight hard to get equality and opportunity in accessing higher education. Not many universities in Indonesia are willing to accept persons with disabilities as students. They still assume that people with disabilities will not be able to attend lecture programs because of their physical limitations, which can interfere the teaching and learning process in classrooms (Soleh, 2014).

In implementing inclusive education in higher education, students get the freedom to take courses according to their needs and abilities. Students need to be aware of their personal goals for studying because college hours tend to be flexible compared to the high school level. Learning locations make students have to manage their time well. Students with disabilities are independent and skilled in using assistive devices to participate in academic activities well. In particular, students with disabilities need to understand the various disability services provided by their campus. Accommodation in learning provides support for students with disabilities to gain access to appropriate learning. Students need to recognize the facilities offered, such as academic supervisors, student activity units, health facilities, and career support.

Some universities use specific instruments to reject prospective students from among people with disabilities, such as through the Student Admissions brochure. The brochure contains the rules or requirements for “non-disability or other disabilities” for prospective students. The current regulation states that one of the requirements to take part in the national university selection is “physically and mentally healthy”. This is one of the discriminations for persons with disabilities.

The gap in implementing inclusive education at the tertiary level in Indonesia is a critical study that needs to be studied more deeply. Students with disabilities follow a special selection that is different from students in general. People with disabilities can support campus life. So, in this article, it is essential to discuss the following: How is the implementation of inclusive education in higher education from student acceptance? How are the facilities and infrastructure available in universities for students with disabilities? How is the support of human resources in universities in implementing inclusive education for students with disabilities?

2. Method

The literature review is carried out by selecting peer-reviewed journal articles published from 2000 to 2021. Steps are taken in field selection, analysis, and categorization. Eleven relevant peer-reviewed articles were selected in the current study and focused on the theme of implementing the development of inclusive education at the tertiary level. Article selection starts from peer-reviewed research journals at Google Scholar. Before searching for keywords, filter only articles with peer review, and the full text is available. The keyword used in the search was “Gap in implementing inclusive education at the university level in Indonesia.”

In the final screening, articles containing research questions were selected "implementation of inclusive education development at the tertiary level" used as literature material in this article. There were 14 articles, both national and international (Table 1). Then a literature review was carried out by utilizing the best evidence approach from the found articles. Each article was reviewed and analyzed further, considering some of the research questions that had been set. The researchers ensured that each article

used as a reference was in accordance with the research question and provided answers to the research questions.

3. Results

Based on the analysis, it can be seen that the implementation of inclusive education at the higher education level applies the principle of inclusive education as a challenge (Moriña, 2017). There are four main challenges towards inclusive education at the higher education level (Collins, Azmat & Rentschler, 2019), including 1) staff perceptions of too many resources that create student dependence, 2) staff training needs, 3) low representation of students with a visible disability, 4) shifting inclusion outside of education into work. Its challenges are essential to discuss. It is based on the data submitted that some staff finds it difficult to accommodate students with disabilities due to a lack of knowledge, training, and awareness of disabilities (Bunbury, 2020). In addition, another finding was conveyed that the importance of inclusive curriculum design in higher education as an effective form of adjustment was made in ensuring inclusive practices in the academic field (Dias & Soares, 2018). In addition, an effective step that inclusive education providers can provide a platform for students with disabilities to express their needs. An example way is addressing existing policy practices in higher institutions and can also help design inclusive policies that are more accessible to all students, including students with disabilities (Tugli et al., 2016).

Table 1. Implementation of Inclusive Education at the Higher Education level

Author(s)	Findings
A. K. Tugli, M. Mokonoto, N.J. Ramakuela & L.M. Netshikwet. (2016)	Demonstrates that the needs of students with disabilities significantly exceed existing inclusive policy practices. Therefore, disability policies should be informed by the needs of affected students. The policy needs significantly exceed existing institutional policy practices, providing a platform for express needs students with disabilities. Existing policy practices in higher institutions can assist in policy design more accessible inclusion.
Martin J. Haigh. (2002)	Design a curriculum that serves global priorities versus national priorities. That does not rely on prior knowledge of local evidence, where students from all sources have equal opportunities for advancement in an inclusive learning environment. That serves to acquaint stay-at-home students with the demands of increasingly global work.
D. Bell, A. Carl, & E. SwartE. (2016)	Functions of Disability Support Services Units in tertiary institutions in South Africa have an essential role in ensuring the inclusion and strategy of students with disabilities in the sector

	and achieving the desired integrated approach. Current functionality varies greatly between DUs operating in different (Higher Education Institutions) and different levels of sophistication in service rendering.
Jamil Salmi & Anna D'Addio. (2021)	<p>Equitable access and success at the higher education level cannot be underestimated by identity, background, and ability still determine educational opportunities.</p> <p>Greater priority should be given to students with disabilities to define their needs, provide adequate resources, and empower higher education institutions to place this dimension high on their equity agenda.</p>
Alan Skelton. (2002)	Maximizing the role of the Inclusive Learning Environment in higher education institutions through reconstruction activities as a context in which “knowledge democracy” occurs.
Diana Dias & Diana Soares (2018)	Incorporating the civic dimension/citizenship values into the academic curriculum can be a practical step towards more inclusive education.
Carmen Márquez & Noelia Melero Aguilar. (2021)	The barriers to inclusion that universities must overcome and implement appropriate strategies enable them to advance towards a more inclusive university culture, policies, and practices.
Anabel Moriña. (2017)	Apply the principle of inclusive education in higher education.
Stephen Bunbury. (2010)	<p>The inclusive curriculum design is important in universities to ensure inclusive practice.</p> <p>However, the data shows that there is still staff who have difficulty accommodating students with disabilities due to a lack of knowledge, training, and awareness of disabilities. Therefore, it is recommended for higher education institutions to shift their focus to a social model of disability that focuses on attitudes to change staff perceptions of students with disabilities.</p>
Ayse Collins, Fara Azmat, Ruth Rentschler. (2018)	Emphasizes the need to inculcate employability and skills development in all aspects of teaching and learning while moving towards inclusive education, to enable all students to develop professionally, and strengthen the call for an inclusive workplace that respects and accepts children with special needs.
Fajar Indra Septiana & Zulfa Rahmah Effendi. (2020)	The equality and inclusiveness in higher education in Indonesia can realize by the government stipulates regulations that support the implementation of higher education for students with disabilities. Its support is associated with the fulfillment of the rights of students with disabilities that are accommodated by higher education providers starting from admission policies,

	facilities and infrastructure, approaches, approaches, curriculum adaptation, and the learning process.
Akhmad Soleh. (2014)	Several universities in Yogyakarta already have an integrated system for people with disabilities, while some have implemented an inclusion system that can accommodate services for students with disabilities.
Andayani, Muhrisun Afandi. (2013)	Communities with disabilities in accessing higher education are provided with assistance and empowerment through the following activities: 1) the socialization and engagement stage, 2) the intervention stage through empowerment and mentoring activities, 3) program termination and evaluation.
Junaedi Sastradiharja, E., Farizal MS, Maran Sutarya. 2020	There are still gaps in access to higher education. These gaps can be seen by the availability and readiness of the institution, the limitation of student admissions. The learning model applied is based on vocational education by implementing the Individualized Educational Program to integrate the adaptive thematic integrated curriculum with 25% cognitive and 75% skill load.

Maximizing the role of the inclusive learning environment in higher education institutions through reconstruction activities as a context in which “knowledge democracy” occurs (Skelton, 2002) by designing curricula for students with disabilities that prioritize needs and have equal opportunities for progress (Haigh, 2002). Greater priority should be given to students with disabilities to define their needs, provide sufficient resources, and empower higher education institutions to place this dimension on their equity agenda (Salmi & D'Addio, 2021). It is also good to design adaptive curricula. Good design curricula emphasize the need to instill employability and skills development in all aspects of teaching and learn to enable students to develop professionally and work in an inclusive workplace that respects and accepts graduates with disabilities (Collins, Azmat & Rentschler, 2019). Barriers to inclusion that higher education providers must overcome and adopt appropriate strategies enable them to advance towards a more inclusive university culture, policies, and practices (Márquez & Aguilar, 2020).

In Indonesia, the government establishes regulations that support the implementation of higher education for students with disabilities. These regulations are linked to the fulfillment of the rights for students with disabilities that are accommodated by higher education providers starting from the admissions policy, facilities and infrastructure, approaches, approaches, curriculum adaptation, and learning processes (Septiana & Effendi, 2019). However, several PTNs in Yogyakarta already have an integrated system for people with disabilities. At the same time, some universities have also implemented an inclusion system that can accommodate services for students with

disabilities (Soleh, 2014). Persons with disabilities in accessing higher education still require empowerment and assistance with the following activities: 1) the socialization stage, 2) the intervention stage through empowerment and mentoring activities, 3) program termination and evaluation (Andayani & Afandi, 2019). These activities still have gaps in accessing higher education in the form of restrictions on student admissions and the availability and readiness of higher education institutions that have not accommodated the needs of people with disabilities. In addition, the learning model offered is through an entire class model through vocational study program activities with 25% cognitive load, and 75% skills based on the Individualized Educational Program integrated with the adaptive curriculum (Sastradiharja et al., 2020).

4. Discussions

Inclusive education is an educational concept that pays attention to all aspects of acceptance and opportunities for children with special needs to obtain equal fundamental education rights as human beings. In 2009, the Ministry of National Education expressly stipulated inclusive education for persons with disabilities. In 2014, the Ministry of Education and Culture reaffirmed to improve the quality of education for children with special needs at the tertiary level. They provide sufficient resources and utilize higher education for equitable distribution of higher education for children with special needs to be made a priority. In this case, learning and curriculum design for children with special needs also requires modification and innovation. Supratiwi et al. (2020) have carried out a learning innovation for children with special needs at the higher education level by implementing Blended Learning. In this study, appropriate learning modifications provide a level of learning outcomes for children with special needs at the university.

Indonesia's efforts to innovate and modify children's learning with special needs in inclusion are very diverse. In line with this, Sastradiharja (2020) states that several learning models are applied in inclusive universities, such as full inclusion classes, cluster classes, pullouts, special classes with various integrations, and complete special classes. However, in its implementation, this inclusive higher education applies children with special needs to study in regular classes but sometimes study in special classes. This policy was made for consideration to facilitate the implementation of inclusive education in higher education itself. Tugli (2016) said one of the efforts carried out by inclusive education abroad by providing for the needs of students with disabilities by providing a platform for students with disabilities to express their needs. This effort is essential and works to overcome existing policy practices and assist with more appropriate inclusion policies. The provision of a platform that can be used as a first step towards inclusive education is to provide a Disability Unit which has an essential role in ensuring inclusion and strategies for students with disabilities to achieve an integrated approach (Metropolis (FOTIM), 2011) through 4 recommended themes presented among others: 1) Inclusiveness

in higher education, 2) Student demographics and defining target groups, 3) Disability Units in tertiary institutions, 4) Access and universal design.

The latest regulation in 2017, the Ministry of Research and Higher Education, stipulates regulation Number 46 of 2017 concerning special services for students with special needs in Higher Education. Inclusive education aims to provide access to appropriate, relevant, and affordable education for children with special needs. There are several challenges in planning and implementing inclusive education services, whether in primary, secondary, or higher-level schools. One of the challenges of inclusive education is the perception of the surrounding environment towards children with special needs that still needs attention. Muryanti and Mulyani (2018) explain in their research that several things need to be considered in inclusive education in higher education, such as the lack of stakeholders in the awareness and involvement of inclusive universities. With these problems, researchers are making efforts with the whole system involved in the implementation process. Students and educators must realize that they are in an inclusive higher education so that all stakeholders are accustomed to providing services to students with special needs. In addition, Bunbury (2020) expresses that inclusion in higher education implement is still experiencing obstacles such as the staff, management, curriculum, which still do not accommodate students with disabilities in inclusive universities. We suggest shifting attention to the social model of disability, which can be an effort to change staff perceptions of students with disabilities and improve management and curriculum in universities.

Accessibility in higher education for children with special needs is an essential support for implementing inclusive education (Alfaris, 2017). Alfaris (2017) gives two categories to support children with special needs in higher education. The first category is facilities that can be used by all, such as access roads, libraries, and waiting rooms that provide access for children with special needs. The second category is specifically for children with special needs, such as bathrooms (Alfaris, 2017). The universities in Indonesia have implemented inclusive education. They have provided accessibility of facilities and infrastructure, but efforts have been made, but it is still not evenly distributed. On the other side, some buildings and public facilities are not friendly to disabilities who study at the university (Jefri, 2016). The implementation of inclusive education in higher education has been implemented in several regions in Indonesia, but it has not been manifested optimally in its implementation in the field.

5. Conclusion

Higher education inclusion in Indonesia has been regulated in Law no. 12 of 2012 concerning Higher Education Article 3. However, there are still few persons with disabilities who can access inclusive education in higher education. The main problem because higher education providers are not yet ready, especially in human resources

(staff), management, and infrastructure. Constraints, as well as challenges faced by universities in implementing inclusive education, are determined by three factors, namely (1) problems in terms of provisions for admitting prospective students with disabilities, (2) do not have infrastructure that supports people with disabilities to be able to do activities and mobilize in the campus environment. and (3) the unavailability of adequate human resources and management both in quantity and quality in developing inclusive education in higher education. However, several universities have been open, intensive, and consistent in accepting prospective students with special needs and have disabled service centers even though the numbers are not significant. Awareness and involvement of inclusive higher education stakeholders are needed. In the implementation process, it provides services to students with special needs.

The current study provides a reasonably clear picture that higher education inclusion in Indonesia is still faced with various problems. Many universities are passive by not providing particular pathways and special services for persons with disabilities. Given these problems, it is crucial to encourage the government through the ministry of education and culture to develop and implement inclusive universities in Indonesia so that persons with disabilities can access inclusive education services in higher education. Social support to the physical and non-physical accessibility for people with disabilities needs to be prepared. Social support can develop the intellectual and potential of people with disabilities, such as efforts to publicize.

The universities are always open and have academic services for people with disabilities and provide facilities and infrastructure to support innovative academic quality, including inclusive education. Inclusive education in higher education will achieve optimal results if there is a collaboration with the community, organizations, government, and NGOs to channel the potential or talents of students with disabilities after completing their education in higher education to obtain jobs that match their abilities. With the current action, the goal of education, especially for persons with disabilities, should be future-oriented and have continuity.

Reference

- Alfaris, M. R. (2017). Dukungan Sosial dan Aksesibilitas Pendidikan Inklusi Di Perguruan Tinggi Berorientasi Masa Depan dan Kontinuitas. *Prosiding Praktik Pendidikan Bagi Penyandang Disabilitas*. Malang: PSLD UB.
- Andayani, A., & Afandi, M. (2019). Pemberdayaan dan Pendampingan Komunitas Penyandang Disabilitas Dalam Mengakses Pendidikan Tinggi. *Aplikasia: Jurnal Aplikasi Ilmu-ilmu Agama*, 16(2), 153-166.
<https://doi.org/10.14421/aplikasia.v16i2.1178>
- Collins, A., Azmat, F., & Rentschler, R. (2019). 'Bringing everyone on the same journey': revisiting inclusion in higher education. *Studies in Higher Education*, 44(8), 1475-1487. <https://doi/full/10.1080/03075079.2018.1450852>

- Bunbury, S. (2020). Disability in higher education—do reasonable adjustments contribute to an inclusive curriculum?. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 24(9), 964-979. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2018.1503347>
- Dias, D., & Soares, D. (2018). Civic learning outcomes: a step towards an inclusive higher education. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 22(4), 360-374. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2017.1365956>
- Haigh, M. J. (2002). Internationalisation of the curriculum: Designing inclusive education for a small world. *Journal of Geography in Higher Education*, 26(1), 49-66. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03098260120110368>
- Jefri, T. (2016). Aksesibilitas sarana dan prasarana bagi penyandang tunadaksa di Universitas Brawijaya. *IJDS: INDONESIAN JOURNAL OF DISABILITY STUDIES*, 3(1), 16-25.
- Márquez, C., & Melero Aguilar, N. (2020). Advancing towards inclusion: recommendations from faculty members of Spanish universities. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 1-15. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2020.1858977>
- Metropolis (FOTIM), F. of T. I. of the N. (2011). *Disability in higher education: Project report*. University of the Witwatersrand Pretoria.
- Muryanti, M., & Mulyani, T. (2018). Motivasi Dan Harapan Mahasiswa Difable Terhadap Pendidikan Inklusi Di Uin Sunan Kalijaga. *Dimensia: Jurnal Kajian Sosiologi*, 7(1).
- Salmi, J., & D'Addio, A. (2021). Policies for achieving inclusion in higher education. *Policy Reviews in Higher Education*, 5(1), 47-72. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23322969.2020.1835529>
- Sastradiharja, E. J., Farizal, M. S., & Sutarya, M. (2020). Pendidikan Inklusi Di Perguruan Tinggi. *Alim| Journal Of Islamic Education*, 2(1), 101-118.
- Septiana, F. I., & Effendi, Z. R. (2019). *Mewujudkan Akses Pendidikan Tinggi Bagi Penyandang Disabilitas*. 1(01), 8.
- Septiana, F. I., & Effendi, Z. R. (2020). Mewujudkan Akses Pendidikan Tinggi Bagi Penyandang Disabilitas. *Inclusive: Journal Of Special Education*, 5(1).
- Skelton, A. (2002). Towards Inclusive Learning Environments in Higher Education? Reflections on a Professional Development Course for University Lecturers. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 7(2), 193-214. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562510220124213>
- Soleh, A. (2014). Kebijakan perguruan tinggi negeri yogyakarta terhadap penyandang disabilitas. *Jurnal pendidikan islam*, 3(1), 1-30.

- Supratiwi, M., Yusuf, M., Anggrellanggi, A., & Martika, T. (2020). Implementasi Model Blended Learning Terhadap Peningkatan Pemahaman Mata Kuliah Pembelajaran Ipa Bagi Anak Berkebutuhan Khusus (Abk) Pada Kelas Inklusi Di Perguruan Tinggi. *Special: Special and Inclusive Education Journal*, 1(1), 1-7.
- Tugli, A. K., Mokonoto, M., Ramakuela, N. J., & Netshikweta, L. M. (2016). Inclusive Policy and Service Needs Survey among Students with Disabilities in an Institution of Higher Education. *International Journal of Educational Sciences*, 14(1-2), 7-12. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09751122.2016.11890473>.
- Haigh, M. J. (2002). Internationalisation of the curriculum: Designing inclusive education for a small world. *Journal of Geography in Higher Education*, 26(1), 49-66.
- Bell, D., Carl, A., & Swart, E. (2016). Students with hearing impairment at a South African university: Self-identity and disclosure. *African journal of disability*, 5(1).
- Márquez, C., & Melero-Aguilar, N. (2021). What are their thoughts about inclusion? Beliefs of faculty members about inclusive education. *Higher Education*, 1-16.
- Moriña, A. (2017). Inclusive education in higher education: challenges and opportunities. *European Journal of Special Needs Education*, 32(1), 3-17. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08856257.2016.1254964>
- Sastradiharja, E. J., Farizal, M. S., & Sutarya, M. (2020). Pendidikan Inklusi Di Perguruan Tinggi. *Alim| Journal of Islamic Education*, 2(1), 101-118.